

Minutes of the Board Meeting of the  
Interim Haiti Recovery Commission (IHRC)

Tuesday, 14 December 2010  
Hilton Santo Domingo  
Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic

**Present:** Annex I lists the Board Members and other persons present at the Board meeting and in attendance by telephone or videoconference. Also present at the Board meeting were certain Board Members' advisors, who are not reflected in these minutes. Also present at the Board meeting were members of the press, who are not reflected in these minutes.

The meeting of the Board (the "Board") of the Interim Haiti Recovery Commission (the "IHRC") was called to order at approximately 5:15 p.m. (Dominican Republic time) by Prime Minister Bellerive and President Clinton, who served as Co-Chairs of the meeting. Prime Minister Bellerive attended the Board meeting by way of videoconference. All persons participating in the meeting were able to communicate with each other. At the request of President Clinton, the Board Members in attendance conducted a roll call. A quorum of Board Members was present.

#### **UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PROJECTS**

The first order of business at the Board Meeting was an update on the status of previously approved projects. President Clinton stated that the Board had already approved approximately \$2.6 billion in projects and that an additional \$500 million in projects would be considered by the Board at this meeting.

Board member P.J. Patterson (CARICOM) asked when Board members would have the opportunity to deal with certain procedural matters. He said that he was referring to the minutes of the 6 October 2010 Board meeting circulated to the Board and indicated that he was not in a position to approve those minutes because he did not believe that they reflected what occurred at the 6 October 2010 Board meeting. President Clinton indicated that the minutes of the 6 October 2010 Board meeting could be discussed at an earlier point in the meeting than indicated on the agenda in order to accommodate Mr. Patterson's schedule.

The Board next watched a video regarding the progress and work of the IHRC.

President Leonel Fernandez of the Dominican Republic then joined the Board meeting to welcome everyone to Santo Domingo and to wish the Board a productive meeting. He made remarks regarding the work underway in Haiti and what remains to be done. He indicated that the Dominican Republic supports Haiti's recovery.

#### **STRATEGIC PLAN FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE MANDATE**

The co-Chairs next turned to Gabriel Verret, Executive Director of the IHRC, to give a presentation regarding the strategic plan for the remainder of the IHRC's mandate. Mr. Verret indicated that Board members had received a copy of the plan in their meeting materials. He discussed the purpose of the plan, the targets set forth in the plan, and the plan going forward.

Certain Board members, including Pierre Duquesne (France), Cheryl Mills (United States), Joseph G. Louis (Haitian local authorities), Espen Rikter-Svendsen (Norway) and Ricardo Seitenfus (Organization of American States), commented on the project materials and the strategic plan. The Co-chairs and Board members discussed the strategic plan, as well as donor funding commitments, capacity-building in Haiti, and the future of the IHRC upon the expiration of its mandate in October 2011.

## **DISCUSSION OF GOVERNANCE ISSUES**

After Mr. Verret's presentation, President Clinton returned to the concerns raised by Mr. Patterson. Mr. Patterson said that at the 6 October 2010 Board meeting there was a recommendation to establish three working committees, in the areas of debris removal, private sector development and housing. He said that he did not see any indication of this recommendation in the minutes of the 6 October 2010 Board meeting and suggested that the recommendation be included. Mr. Patterson stated further that he did not think that the minutes of the 6 October 2010 Board meeting fully reflected the contributions made by Board members, their reservations, their suggestions and the like. Mr. Patterson also expressed his concern that Board members did not receive information on the strategic plan and the projects proposed for approval with enough time to review prior to the Board meetings and said that he had unanswered questions about projects and the project approval process.

President Clinton and Mr. Verret next responded to certain of Mr. Patterson's concerns. President Clinton said that only one Board member had volunteered to serve on the proposed committees. Mr. Verret said that regarding Board meeting minutes, it had been determined to prepare the minutes in a succinct, corporate style, but that the style of the minutes could be altered if Board members desired more detail in the meeting minutes. President Clinton said that the Secretariat of the IHRC would poll Board members as to whether more detail should be included in the meeting minutes.

Regarding the strategic plan, Mr. Verret said that the IHRC was not asking Board members to approve the strategic plan at this meeting. He said that the goal was to present the strategic plan for discussion so that in the near term the IHRC could finalize the strategy and then address the priorities set forth therein. He said that the IHRC initially had been reactive regarding its consideration of projects, but was moving to endorse priorities proactively in order to encourage projects addressing the priorities identified in the strategic plan.

Board member Suze Percy Filippini (Executive Branch of the Government of Haiti) next read a statement signed by the twelve Haitian Board members. The statement said that there was a serious deficit of communication and information on the part of the IHRC Secretariat, and even more so on the part of the Executive Committee. She said that the Secretariat did not seem to be in a position to respond to questions and requests for information from Board members and that Board members had not received any information about the recruitment of personnel by the Secretariat. Ms. Percy Filippini said that the comments of Board member Jean-Marie Bourjolly (Executive Branch of the Government of Haiti) circulated to the Board on 4 October 2010 summarized their situation. The statement was signed by Board members Suze Percy Filippini, Joseph Bernadel, Jean-Marie Bourjolly, Jean Rénald Clérisme, Lucien Francoeur, Claude Jeudy, Gary Lissade, Georges Henry Fils, Joseph G. (Billy) Louis, Raoul Pierre-Louis, Jean-Claude Lebrun and Lucien Jean Bernard.

President Clinton and Mr. Verret responded to certain of Ms. Percy Filippini's comments. Mr. Verret said that he appreciated the criticisms raised by the Haitian Board members and that he understood their frustrations. President Clinton suggested that the IHRC could have an employee of the Secretariat especially dedicated to be available to the Haitian Board members. He said that the IHRC could also allow the Haitian Board members the opportunity to meet with Mr. Verret or members of the IHRC staff twice a month to ask questions and give input. Ms. Percy Filippini indicated that, while she could not speak for all twelve Haitian Board members, she welcomed President Clinton's suggestion. President Clinton reiterated that the IHRC should give the Haitian Board members better day-to-day support and more input.

Board member Joseph Bernadel (Haitian diaspora) next indicated his support for the statement read by Ms. Percy Filippini. He said further that the diaspora was eager to help with recovery efforts. He suggested that the diaspora would help with the creation of a diaspora development bank. President Clinton said the he welcomed Mr. Bernadel's suggestion.

Board member Jean-Marie Bourjolly (Executive Branch of the Government of Haiti) expressed his support for the statement read by Ms. Percy Filippini and added that Board members – and not just the Haitian Board members – should meet regularly with the Secretariat of the IHRC. He said that he had been frustrated that the both the Secretariat and the two Co-chairs did not always respond to e-mail messages. He added that such a lack of responsiveness represents not just impoliteness, but also a fault in governance.

Representative Soichi Sato (Japan) mentioned that Japan announced a contribution of \$100 million dollars last March, of which \$72 million has already been disbursed and also decided to disburse \$30 million dollars to the Haiti Reconstruction Fund (HRF) last month.

President Clinton concluded the discussion by noting that it was important to take account of where the IHRC is versus where it was. He said that the IHRC Secretariat had been set up and was making progress, but that it needs to better support the Board members, especially the Haitian Board members.

## **PRESENTATION OF SECTOR-SPECIFIC PLANS**

President Clinton suggested that the Board move on to the sector-specific presentations. He said that there would be an opportunity for Board members to ask questions about the presentations after all three presentations were completed.

President Clinton first introduced Mr. William Vastine, the IHRC's debris removal sector leader, who gave a presentation on debris removal. After Mr. Vastine's presentation, President Clinton asked him questions about setting up a prompt payment system for paying Haitian contractors. Mr. Vastine said that he would send a list of under-employed Haitian contractors to President Clinton and Board members.

President Clinton next introduced Ms. Priscilla Phelps, the IHRC's housing sector leader, who gave a presentation regarding housing.

President Clinton introduced Dr. Claire Pierre, the IHRC's health sector leader, who gave a presentation regarding health. Dr. Pierre also made some remarks about the cholera situation in Haiti.

President Clinton next invited questions from the Board. Several Board members thanked the sector leaders for their presentations and indicated support for the work they were doing. Board member David Moloney (Canada) suggested that Board members should identify to the sector leaders their pipeline projects that are not yet ready for approval so that the sector leaders could get a view of funding gaps. Mr. Moloney also said that Board members should show the sector plans to the NGOs from their respective countries and find out what projects are in their pipelines. Board alternate member Nigel Fisher (United Nations Development Programme) reminded Board members of the need to ensure basic social protection measures for the most vulnerable Haitians, such as women and children. He also emphasized the importance of integrating a gender perspective and approach into projects and programs approved by the IHRC. Finally, he suggested including gender equity, women's role in economic and social development and their participation in decisions affecting them as a topic on the agenda of a future IHRC meeting.

Several Board members asked questions and made comments about the sector plans, and President Clinton and the IHRC sector leaders responded to the questions. In addition, Ms. Phelps commented on the housing exposition and discussed the different impacts of housing reconstruction on owners and renters of housing.

### **PRESENTATION OF STRATEGY FOR THE HAITI RECONSTRUCTION FUND**

Mr. Verret next gave a presentation regarding the IHRC's proposal for the optimized use of resources to the HRF.

### **BRIEFING ON CHOLERA EPIDEMIC**

Dr. Alex Larsen, the Minister of Public Health of the Government of Haiti, next gave an update on the cholera epidemic in Haiti.

### **RATIFICATION OF MINUTES OF 6 OCTOBER 2010 BOARD MEETING**

The Board next turned to the approval of the minutes of the 6 October 2010 Board meeting. A motion was made and seconded to ratify the minutes of the 6 October 2010 Board meeting. The Board approved and adopted the following resolution:

RESOLVED, that the Board hereby approves and adopts the Minutes of the 6 October 2010 meeting of the Board as provided to the Board.

The resolution was approved by a majority of voting Board members in attendance, with zero (0) voting Board members in attendance abstaining, and one (1) voting Board member in attendance opposed (Board member Jean-Marie Bourjolly). Board member P.J. Patterson indicated prior to his departure from the meeting that he opposed the approval of the minutes of the 6 October 2010 Board meeting.

### **APPROVAL OF PROPOSED PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS**

President Clinton next summarized the projects recommended for Board approval. Board member Pierre Duquesne (France) raised concerns regarding one of the projects (CN000130). He said that he had already raised such concerns in an e-mail message to the

Board. Mr. Duquesne said that the project was not financed and that moreover, he did not see how a private Irish institution could train 40,000 Haitian teachers. Mr. Duquesne proposed that the project should be debated at the next Board meeting.

In response to Mr. Duquesne's comment, President Clinton suggested deferring approval of Project CN000130 and approving the remainder of the projects presented for approval.

A motion was made and seconded to ratify the projects presented to the Board for approval, with the exception of Project CN000130. The Board approved and adopted the following resolution:

RESOLVED, that the Board hereby approves all of the projects set forth on Exhibit A as described in the materials provided to the Board on 7 December 2010, with the exception of Project CN000130, subject to implementation in accordance with IHRC guidelines.

The resolution was approved by a majority of Voting Board Members in attendance, with zero (0) voting Board members in attendance abstaining, and zero (0) voting Board members in attendance opposed.

President Clinton noted that additional projects had been approved by the Executive Committee and by the Executive Director, as permitted by the Bylaws of the IHRC, and that those projects were listed in the Board members' meeting materials.

## **CLOSING**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at approximately 11:30 p.m.

Prime Minister Bellerive  
Co-Chair

President Clinton  
Co-Chair

**ANNEX I  
BOARD MEMBERS ATTENDING 14 DECEMBER 2010 MEETING**

Prime Minister Bellerive	Co-Chair (by videoconference)
President Clinton	Co-Chair
Lucien Jean Bernard	Senate of Haiti
Lucien Francoeur	Chamber of Deputies of Haiti
Jean Rénaud Clérismé	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Suze Percy Filippini	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Claude Jeudy	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Jean-Marie Bourjolly	Executive Branch of Government of Haiti
Georges Henry Fils	Judicial Branch of Government of Haiti
Gary Lissade	Judicial Branch of Government of Haiti
Joseph Gontran "Billy" Louis	Haitian Local Authorities (Mayors)
Raoul Pierre-Louis	Haitian Local Authorities (CASECS)
Jean-Claude Lebrun	Haitian Labor Unions
Joseph M.G. Bernadel	Haitian Diaspora
P.J. Patterson	CARICOM
Luis Alberto Moreno	Inter-American Development Bank
Nigel Fisher	United Nations Development Programme
Pamela Cox	World Bank
Rubens Gama	Brazil
Irene Horejs	European Union
Cheryl Mills	United States
Espen Rikter-Svendsen	Norway
Luis Rivas	Venezuela
Pierre Duquesne	France
Cristina Barrios	Spain
David Moloney	Canada
Soichi Sato	Japan
Ricardo Seitenfus	Organization of American States
Carolyn Rose-Avila	International NGOs

\*\*\*\*\*

***Also present at the invitation of the Co-Chairs were:***

Gabriel Verret	Executive Director of the IHRC
Priscilla Phelps	IHRC (Housing)
William Vastine	IHRC (Debris Removal)
Dr. Claire Cecile Pierre	IHRC (Health)
Dr. Alex Larsen	Government of Haiti
Yves-Robert Jean	Government of Haiti
Jacques Gabriel	Government of Haiti
Gérald Germain	Government of Haiti
Henry-Robert Louis	Government of Haiti
Gessie Bellerive	Government of Haiti
Leonel Fernandez	President of Dominican Republic
Juan Temistocles Montas	Representative of Dominican Republic
Laura Graham	Chief Operating Officer of The Clinton Foundation
Eric Braverman, Michael Kolbaek, Mathieu Laforest & Ken Schwartz	McKinsey & Company
T. Clark Weymouth, Robert Pender & Jean Blackerby	Hogan Lovells

## EXHIBIT A

### PROJECTS

Fully funded projects				
Project	Sector	Budget	Funding	Proponent
CN000321 – Northern Industrial Park: Phase 1	Job Creation	\$174 M	\$174 M	Government of Haiti, United States of America, Inter-American Development Bank
CN/000014W – USAID New Settlements Project	Housing	\$53.3 M	\$53.3 M	United States of America
CN/000320 – System of agricultural finance and insurance in Haiti	Agriculture	\$22 M	\$22 M	Canada
CN/000298 – Labor Intensive Paving Project in Haiti	Infrastructure	\$21 M	\$21 M	Japan and the Inter-American Development Bank
<b>Total</b>		<b>\$270.3 M</b>	<b>\$270.3 M</b>	
Partially funded or unfunded projects				
Project	Sector	Budget	Funding	Proponent
CN/000208 – Port au Prince Neighborhood Upgrading	Housing	\$65 M	\$0 M	United States of America
CN/000210 – Building Demolition and Debris Removal with Heavy Equipment	Debris	\$25 M	\$0 M	United States of America
CN/000130 – National Institute for In-service Teacher Education	Education	\$60.1 M	\$0.2 M	Quisqueya University and Hibernia University
<b>Total</b>		<b>\$150 M</b>	<b>\$0.2 M</b>	

**Annex II**  
**BOARD MEMBERS' COMMENTS ON PROJECTS**

**Comments received from Board Member Rose-Anne Auguste**

Re: Some preliminary comments on the strategic plan and some suggestions to improve the communication problems at the IHRC

Mr. Executive Director,

Prevented from participating in today's meeting for reasons beyond my control, I would like to extend my apology. I take this opportunity to submit preliminary comments on the strategic plan presented. I also make some suggestions for improving communication problems apparent in the IHRC. I therefore wish everyone a fruitful meeting and promise to be with you at the forthcoming meeting.

I greatly welcome the IHRC operations that have to meet the deadline for submitting projects to the Board of Directors according to prescribed internal rules. I wish from my heart that it works in this area for the success of the process of reconstruction of Haiti.

**Preliminary Comments on Strategic Plan:**

1. I generally welcome the effort made by the IHRC operations to produce this very detailed document to enable us to better monitor the progress of the process and facilitate the flow of ideas to strengthen and enrich the plan.

2. I think I have identified some relevant elements missing in this strategic plan:

- The issue of micro-zoning studies before any reconstruction process in informal settlements and sites. I remember having already insisted on this aspect at the meeting in New York last September. Haiti is a country highly faulted by many seismologists' experts and recent studies have clearly predicted other major earthquakes that will affect the entire southern peninsula and the northern part of the country. I therefore think it fitting that we question the priority class of micro-zoning studies in the strategic plan.

- The plan was mentioned nowhere in the binder that must have existed from the work of CIAT cadastre that regarding housing reconstruction. In this regard, I would suggest we take this opportunity to revisit a bit the configuration of this sector to bring it to be more efficient and dynamic. Instead of providing funding split for each component of this sector, why not work for the unification of the four following bodies to channel financial resources? I am talking about: CNIGS, the National Office of Cadastre, the Bureau of Mines and CIAT. The CNIGS seems unavoidable as an institution to support the work of cadastral offices and mines as well as CIAT. Instead of continuing to finance each of these institutions in such a fragmented manner, the Haitian Government would gain in financial resources by creating an Institute of Planning that would include the four bodies under the aegis of the Prime Minister, Ministry of Planning and external Cooperation, Ministry of Public Works, Ministry of Environment and Ministry of Finance. Too many scattered resources only reinforce the coordination problems of duplication and encourage the waste of financial resources

- The issue of support for violence against women. How to move forward with this vital issue by the end of the mandate of IHRC? The theme will also be a priority in the plan.

- It is imperative to include in the plan, clearly, the issue of advocacy to demand transparency for large Non-Governmental Organization that collected a lot of money in favor of 12 January. I deplore such that so far no debate takes place around the table of the IHRC about it! Unfortunately, this problem of duplication of coordination referred to the last paragraph on page 37 of the plan stems precisely from the lack of control of the Haitian government on the activities of many INGOs who have more financial resources than the sectoral ministries. Many of them continue to operate in the greatest obscurity until

now. We applaud the effort in that particular Canadian Cooperation, which invites all members to join the cooperation process, but would, however, that all other forms of cooperation do so by encouraging INGOs to their countries to act in a transparent providing accountability for all funds collected for the 12 January. This would allow the Haitian Government to make better progress with some projects which disbursements are still slow.

Suggestions for improving communication problems within the IHRC:

1. Executive management must ensure his team's return connections to facilitate communication between all members of the Board, foreigners as well as Haitians. I have an example that many of my communications which were not pursued: my comments on the village life, my comments on some projects presented at the meeting of October 6. I received the response of the co-chair on the comments on the village life and no interaction between people who have received at the motor operating the IHRC. So I cannot know if these comments were directed to the right address or not.

2. Many areas still complain about the lack of information that would enable them to monitor the progress of the operation of the IHRC. It's rather legitimate and the executive management of the IHRC has the duty to work with his team to improve this situation.

Some suggestions to improve the communication strategy:

- Boosting the updated site IHRC steadily. One or two specialists must deal daily updating of the site in recent information and feed, email, media, organized sectors of society, relevant elements posted on this site. It is not enough just to post this information on the site, if not to disseminate as in networks on a weekly basis. We could call this regular broadcast weekly IHRC and send it to all news agencies, in cooperation circuits, circuits and INGOs, NNGOs, organized forces of society (women's movement, movement of peasants, professional associations ), tours of local governments, departments circuits. The communication gap only discredits the HRIC and opens it up to often baseless criticism against members of the board of directors.

- Finally, I want to address the issue of coordination in series which is severely hampering humanitarian post-earthquake management in Haiti. In my view, the government must bring in the first place, all the clusters in the sectoral table to avoid any parallel operation of ministry in the growth areas. Do not reproduce a second error when each department would seek to address specifically a social problem that requires an intersectoral and interdisciplinary approach. The epidemic of cholera, for example, cannot be supported only by the MSPP, if not by different sectors: Health, Education, Emergency Preparedness, but especially water and sanitation, environment, local authorities and the organized forces of the country. I will return with more substantial comments on the sectoral table on pages on page 39 of the strategic plan.

Cordial greetings to everyone and good meeting

Marie Carmèle Rose Anne Auguste  
Community Health leader  
MSc in Health Service Management  
PhD student in Applied Human Sciences  
Member of 1000 Women for Peace  
Interim Haiti Recovery Commission (NGO Representative)

CC: S.E Joseph Jean Max Bellerive, IHRC Co-Chair and Haiti's Prime Minister

S.E. William Jefferson Clinton, IHRC Co-Chair